

Orthogonal Complements and Projections

Recall that two vectors \mathbf{v}_1 & \mathbf{v}_2 in \mathbb{R}^n are *perpendicular* or *orthogonal* provided that their *dot product* vanishes. That is, $\mathbf{v}_1 \perp \mathbf{v}_2$ if and only if $\mathbf{v}_1 \cdot \mathbf{v}_2 = 0$.

Example

1. The vectors $\begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ -3 \\ 4 \end{pmatrix}$ & $\begin{pmatrix} 12 \\ 8 \\ 3 \end{pmatrix}$ in \mathbb{R}^3 are orthogonal while $\begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ -3 \\ 4 \end{pmatrix}$ & $\begin{pmatrix} 4 \\ -6 \\ 7 \end{pmatrix}$ are

not.

2. We can define an *inner product* on the vector space of all polynomials of degree at most 3 by setting

$$\langle f(x), g(x) \rangle = \int_0^1 f(x) g(x) dx.$$

(There is nothing special about integrating over $[0,1]$; This interval was chosen arbitrarily.) Then, for example,

$$\begin{aligned} \langle 2x^2 + 1, 10x^2 + 11x - 11 \rangle &= \int_0^1 (2x^2 + 1) (10x^2 + 11x - 11) dx \\ &= \int_0^1 (20x^4 + 22x^3 - 12x^2 + 11x - 11) dx \\ &= \left(4x^5 + \frac{11}{2}x^4 - 4x^3 + \frac{11}{2}x^2 - 11x \right) \Big|_0^1 \\ &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

Hence, relative to the inner product $\langle f(x), g(x) \rangle = \int_0^1 f(x) g(x) dx$ we have that the

two polynomials $2x^2 + 1$ & $10x^2 + 11x - 11$ are *orthogonal* in \mathbf{P}_3 .

So, more generally, we say that $\mathbf{v}_1 \perp \mathbf{v}_2$ in a vector space V with inner product $\langle \mathbf{u}, \mathbf{v} \rangle$ provided

that $\langle u, v \rangle = 0$.

Example

Consider the 3×4 matrix $A = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 3 & 1 \\ 2 & 3 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 & 8 & 2 \end{pmatrix}$. Then, by the elementary row operations,

we have that $rref(A) = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 8 & 2 \\ 0 & 1 & -5 & -1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$. As discussed in the previous sections, the row

space of A coincides with the row space of $rref(A)$. In this case, we see that a basis for

$R_A = R_{rref(A)}$ is given by $\left\{ \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 8 \\ 2 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ -5 \\ -1 \end{pmatrix} \right\}$. By consideration of $rref(A)$, it follows that the

null space of A , N_A , has a basis given by $\left\{ \begin{pmatrix} -8 \\ 5 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} -2 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} \right\}$. We note that, as per the

Fundamental Theorem of Linear Algebra, that

$$\dim(R_A) + \dim(N_A) = 4 \text{ (= \# of columns of } A \text{)}.$$

Let's consider vectors in $R_A = R_{rref(A)}$ and N_A , say,

$$6 \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 8 \\ 2 \end{pmatrix} + (-2) \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ -5 \\ -1 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 6 \\ -2 \\ 58 \\ 14 \end{pmatrix} \in R_A$$

and

$$(-3) \begin{pmatrix} -8 \\ 5 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} + 4 \begin{pmatrix} -2 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 16 \\ -11 \\ -3 \\ 4 \end{pmatrix} \in N_A.$$

By direct computation we see that

$$\begin{pmatrix} 6 \\ -2 \\ 58 \\ 14 \end{pmatrix} \cdot \begin{pmatrix} 16 \\ -11 \\ -3 \\ 4 \end{pmatrix} = 6(16) + (-2)(-11) + 58(-3) + 14(4) = 0$$

and so $\begin{pmatrix} 6 \\ -2 \\ 58 \\ 14 \end{pmatrix} \perp \begin{pmatrix} 16 \\ -11 \\ -3 \\ 4 \end{pmatrix}.$

So, is this an accident that an element of $\mathbf{R}_A = \mathbf{R}_{\text{ref}(A)}$ is orthogonal to an element of N_A ?

To answer this let's consider the dot product of arbitrary elements of $\mathbf{R}_A = \mathbf{R}_{\text{ref}(A)}$ and N_A .

Since $\left\{ \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 8 \\ 2 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ -5 \\ -1 \end{pmatrix} \right\}$ is a basis for $\mathbf{R}_A = \mathbf{R}_{\text{ref}(A)}$, there exists scalars a & b so that every

vector in $\mathbf{R}_A = \mathbf{R}_{\text{ref}(A)}$ can be written as

$$a \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 8 \\ 2 \end{pmatrix} + b \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ -5 \\ -1 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} a \\ b \\ 8a - 5b \\ 2a - b \end{pmatrix}.$$

Similarly, since $\left\{ \begin{pmatrix} -8 \\ 5 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} -2 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} \right\}$ is a basis for N_A , there exists scalars r & s so that every

vector in N_A can be written as

$$r \begin{pmatrix} -8 \\ 5 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} + s \begin{pmatrix} -2 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} -8r - 2s \\ 5r + s \\ r \\ s \end{pmatrix}.$$

Now,

$$\begin{pmatrix} a \\ b \\ 8a - 5b \\ 2a - b \end{pmatrix} \cdot \begin{pmatrix} -8r - 2s \\ 5r + s \\ r \\ s \end{pmatrix} = a(-8r - 2s) + b(5r + s) + (8a - 5b)r + (2a - b)s = 0.$$

We conclude that if $\mathbf{v} \in R_A$ and $\mathbf{w} \in N_A$, then $\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{w} = 0$ and so $\mathbf{v} \perp \mathbf{w}$.

Definition

Suppose V is a vector space with inner product $\langle u, v \rangle$. (Think $V = \mathbb{R}^n$ and $\langle u, v \rangle = \text{dot}(u, v)$)

1. The subspaces S_1 & S_2 of \mathbb{R}^n are said to be *orthogonal*, denoted $S_1 \perp S_2$, if $\langle v_1, v_2 \rangle = 0$ for all $v_1 \in S_1$ & $v_2 \in S_2$.
2. Let W be a subspace of V . Then we define W^\perp (read “ W perp”) to be the set of vectors in V given by

$$W^\perp = \{ v \in V \mid \langle v, w \rangle = 0 \text{ for all } w \in W \}.$$

The set W^\perp is called the *orthogonal complement* of W .

Examples

1. From the above work, if $A = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 3 & 1 \\ 2 & 3 & 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 & 8 & 2 \end{pmatrix}$, then $R_A \perp N_A$.
2. Let A be any $m \times n$ matrix. Now, the null space N_A of A consists of those vectors x with $Ax = 0_m$. However, $Ax = 0_m$ if and only if $r_i \cdot x = 0$ ($i = 1, \dots, m$) for each row r_i of the matrix A . Hence, the null space of A is the set of all vectors orthogonal to the rows of A and, hence, the row space of A . (Why?) We conclude that $R_A^\perp = N_A$.

The above suggest the following method for finding W^\perp given a subspace W of \mathbb{R}^n .

1. Find a matrix A having as row vectors a generating set for W .
2. Find the null space of A . This null space is W^\perp .

3. Suppose that $\mathbf{S}_1 = \text{span} \left\{ \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \right\}$ and $\mathbf{S}_2 = \text{span} \left\{ \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \right\}$. Then \mathbf{S}_1 & \mathbf{S}_2

are *orthogonal* subspaces of \mathbb{R}^5 . To verify this observe that

$$\begin{aligned} \left(a \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} + b \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \right) \cdot r \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} &= a r \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \cdot \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} + b r \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \cdot \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= a r (0) + b r (0) \\ &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

Thus, $\mathbf{S}_1 \perp \mathbf{S}_2$. Since

$$\left(a \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} + b \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \right) \cdot \begin{pmatrix} -7 \\ -2 \\ 2 \\ 2 \\ 5 \end{pmatrix} = 0$$

and

$$\begin{pmatrix} -7 \\ -2 \\ 2 \\ 2 \\ 5 \end{pmatrix} \notin \mathbf{S}_2,$$

it follows that $\mathbf{S}_1^\perp \neq \mathbf{S}_2$. So, what is the set \mathbf{S}_1^\perp ? Let $\mathbf{B} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$.

Then, from part 2 above, $\mathbf{S}_1^\perp = N_{\mathbf{B}}$. In fact, a basis for $\mathbf{S}_1^\perp = N_{\mathbf{B}}$ can be shown to be

$$\left\{ \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} \right\}.$$

Finally, we note that the set $\left\{ \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \right\} \cup \left\{ \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} \right\}$ forms a basis

for \mathbb{R}^5 . In particular, every element of \mathbb{R}^5 can be written as the sum of a vector in \mathbf{S}_1 and a vector in \mathbf{S}_1^\perp .

4. Let \mathbf{W} be the subspace of \mathbf{P}_3 (= the vector space of all polynomials of degree at most 3) with basis $\{1, x^3\}$. We take as our inner product on \mathbf{P}_3 the function

$$\langle f(x), g(x) \rangle = \int_0^1 f(x) g(x) dx.$$

Find as basis for \mathbf{W}^\perp .

Solution

Let $p(x) = ax^3 + bx^2 + cx + d \in \mathbf{W}^\perp$. Then

$$\langle p(x), g(x) \rangle = \int_0^1 p(x) g(x) dx = 0$$

for all $g(x) \in W$. Hence, in particular,

$$\langle p(x), 1 \rangle = \int_0^1 (ax^3 + bx^2 + cx + d) dx = \frac{a}{4} + \frac{b}{3} + \frac{c}{2} + d = 0$$

and

$$\langle p(x), x^3 \rangle = \int_0^1 (ax^6 + bx^5 + cx^4 + dx^3) dx = \frac{a}{7} + \frac{b}{6} + \frac{c}{5} + \frac{d}{4} = 0.$$

Solving the linear system

$$\frac{a}{4} + \frac{b}{3} + \frac{c}{2} + d = 0$$

$$\frac{a}{7} + \frac{b}{6} + \frac{c}{5} + \frac{d}{4} = 0$$

we find that we have pivot variables of $a = \frac{14}{5}c + 14d$ and $b = -\frac{18}{5}c - \frac{27}{2}d$ with

free variables of c and d . It follows that

$$p(x) = c \left(\frac{14}{5}x^3 - \frac{18}{5}x^2 + x \right) + d \left(14x^3 - \frac{27}{2}x^2 + 1 \right)$$

for some $c, d \in \mathbb{R}$. Hence, the polynomials

$$\frac{14}{5}x^3 - \frac{18}{5}x^2 + x \quad \& \quad 14x^3 - \frac{27}{2}x^2 + 1$$

span W^\perp . Since these two polynomials are not multiples of each other, they are linearly independent and so they form a basis for W^\perp .

Theorem

Suppose that W is a subspace of \mathbb{R}^n .

1. W^\perp is a subspace of \mathbb{R}^n .
2. $\dim(W^\perp) = n - \dim(W)$
3. $(W^\perp)^\perp = W$.
4. Each vector in $\mathbf{b} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ can be expressed uniquely in the form $\mathbf{b} = \mathbf{b}_W + \mathbf{b}_{W^\perp}$ where $\mathbf{b}_W \in W$ and $\mathbf{b}_{W^\perp} \in W^\perp$.

Definition

Let V and W be two subspaces of \mathbb{R}^n . If each vector $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ can be expressed uniquely in the form $\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{v} + \mathbf{w}$ where $\mathbf{v} \in V$ and $\mathbf{w} \in W$, then we say \mathbb{R}^n is the *direct sum* of V and W and we write $\mathbb{R}^n = V \oplus W$.

Example

$$1. \quad \text{span} \left\{ \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \right\} \oplus \text{span} \left\{ \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \right\}^\perp$$

$$= \text{span} \left\{ \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \right\} \oplus \text{span} \left\{ \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} \right\} = \mathbb{R}^5$$

$$\begin{aligned}
2. \quad & \text{span} \{ x^3, 1 \} \oplus \text{span} \{ x^3, 1 \}^\perp \\
&= \text{span} \{ x^3, 1 \} \oplus \text{span} \left\{ \frac{14}{5}x^3 - \frac{18}{5}x^2 + x, 14x^3 - \frac{27}{2}x^2 + 1 \right\} = \mathbf{P}_3
\end{aligned}$$

Fundamental Subspaces of a Matrix

Let A be an $m \times n$ matrix. Then the *four fundamental subspaces* of A are

$$R_A = \text{row space of } A \quad (= R_{\text{rref}(A)})$$

$$N_A = \text{null space of } A$$

$$C_A = \text{column space of } A \quad (= R_{A^T})$$

$$N_{A^T} = \text{null space of } A^T$$

Example

$$\text{Let } A = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 5 & 3 & 7 \\ 2 & 0 & -4 & -6 \\ 4 & 7 & -1 & 2 \end{pmatrix}. \text{ Since } \text{rref}(A) = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & -2 & -3 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 2 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}, \text{ it follows that}$$

$$R_A \text{ has a basis of } \{ (1, 0, -2, -3), (0, 1, 1, 2) \}$$

and that

$$N_A \text{ has a basis of } \{ (3, -2, 0, 1), (2, -1, 1, 0) \}.$$

$$\text{Because } \text{rref}(A^T) = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & \frac{7}{5} \\ 0 & 1 & \frac{13}{10} \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}, \text{ we have that}$$

$$C_A \text{ has a basis of } \left\{ \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ \frac{7}{5} \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ \frac{13}{10} \end{pmatrix} \right\}$$

and that

$$N_{A^T} \text{ consists of all scalar multiples of the vector } \begin{pmatrix} -\frac{7}{5} \\ -\frac{13}{10} \\ 1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

Fundamental Theorem of Linear Algebra - Part II

Let A be an $m \times n$ matrix.

1. N_A is the orthogonal complement of R_A in \mathbb{R}^n .
2. N_{A^T} is the orthogonal complement of C_A in \mathbb{R}^m .
3. $N_A \oplus R_A = \mathbb{R}^n$
4. $N_{A^T} \oplus C_A = \mathbb{R}^m$

Example

Let $A = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 5 & 3 & 7 \\ 2 & 0 & -4 & -6 \\ 4 & 7 & -1 & 2 \end{pmatrix}$. Write $\mathbf{v} = (12, -10, -14, -26)$ uniquely as the sum of a

vector in R_A and a vector in N_A . It is sufficient to $a, b, c, d \in \mathbb{R}$ so that

$$(a(1, 0, -2, -3) + b(0, 1, 1, 2)) + (c(3, -2, 0, 1) + d(2, -1, 1, 0)) = \mathbf{v}.$$

Reducing the associated augmented matrix

$$\left(\begin{array}{cccc|c} 1 & 0 & 3 & 2 & 12 \\ 0 & 1 & -2 & -1 & -10 \\ -2 & 1 & 0 & 1 & -14 \\ -3 & 2 & 1 & 0 & -26 \end{array} \right)$$

to

$$\left(\begin{array}{cccc|c} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 5 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & -6 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 2 \end{array} \right)$$

we see that $a = 5$, $b = -6$, $c = 1$ and $d = 2$.

Set

$$\mathbf{r} = 5(1, 0, -2, -3) - 6(0, 1, 1, 2) = (5, -6, -16, -27) \in R_A$$

and

$$\mathbf{s} = (3, -2, 0, 1) + 2(2, -1, 1, 0) = (7, -4, 2, 1) \in N_A.$$

Then $\mathbf{v} = \mathbf{r} + \mathbf{s}$. Why is this the only way to represent $\mathbf{v} = (12, -10, -14, -26)$ as a sum of a vector from R_A and a vector from N_A ?

Definition

Let $\mathbf{b} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ and let W be a subspace of \mathbb{R}^n . If $\mathbf{b} = \mathbf{b}_W + \mathbf{b}_{W^\perp}$ where $\mathbf{b}_W \in W$ and

$\mathbf{b}_{W^\perp} \in W^\perp$, then we call \mathbf{b}_W the *projection* of \mathbf{b} onto W and write $\mathbf{b}_W = \text{proj}_W \mathbf{b}$.

Example

1. Suppose $\mathbf{b} = (12, -10, -14, -26) \in \mathbb{R}^4$ and W is the subspace of \mathbb{R}^4 with basis vectors $\{(1, 0, -2, -3), (0, 1, 1, 2)\}$. Then, by the previous example, $\text{proj}_W \mathbf{b} = (5, -6, -16, -27)$.

2. Find $\text{proj}_W \mathbf{b} \in \mathbb{R}^3$ if $\mathbf{b} = (2, 1, 5)$ and $W = \text{span}\{(1, 2, 1), (2, 1, -1)\}$.

Solution

We note that $(1, 2, 1)$ & $(2, 1, -1)$ are linearly independent and, hence, form a basis for W .

So, we find a basis for W^\perp by finding the null space for

$$A = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 2 & 1 \\ 2 & 1 & -1 \end{pmatrix}$$

or, equivalently,

$$\text{rref}\left(\begin{pmatrix} 1 & 2 & 1 \\ 2 & 1 & -1 \end{pmatrix}\right) = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & -1 \\ 0 & 1 & 1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

We see that $W^\perp = \langle (1, -1, 1) \rangle$. We now seek $x_1, x_2, x_3 \in \mathbb{R}$ so that

$$(*) \quad (2, 1, 5) = (x_1 (1, 2, 1) + x_2 (2, 1, -1)) + x_3 (1, -1, 1).$$

(Of course, $\text{proj}_W \mathbf{b} = x_1 (1, 2, 1) + x_2 (2, 1, -1)$.)

To solve the equation (*) it is sufficient to row reduce the augmented matrix

$$\left(\begin{array}{ccc|c} 1 & 2 & 1 & 2 \\ 2 & 1 & -1 & 1 \\ 1 & -1 & 1 & 5 \end{array}\right)$$

obtaining

$$\left(\begin{array}{ccc|c} 1 & 0 & 0 & 2 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & -1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 2 \end{array}\right).$$

Thus, $\text{proj}_W \mathbf{b} = (2) (1, 2, 1) + (-1) (2, 1, -1) = (0, 3, 3)$. We observe that there exists a

matrix P given by

$$P = \frac{1}{3} \begin{pmatrix} 2 & 1 & -1 \\ 1 & 2 & 1 \\ -1 & 1 & 2 \end{pmatrix} \quad (= A^T (A A^T)^{-1} A)$$

so that

$$\mathbf{P} \mathbf{b} = \text{proj}_{\mathbf{W}} \mathbf{b}.$$

We call \mathbf{P} the *projection matrix*. The projection matrix given by $\mathbf{P} = \mathbf{A}^T (\mathbf{A} \mathbf{A}^T)^{-1} \mathbf{A}$ (where the rows of \mathbf{A} form a basis for \mathbf{W}) is expensive computationally but if one is computing several projections onto \mathbf{W} it may very well be worth the effort as the above formula is valid for all vectors \mathbf{b} .

3. Find the projection of $(1, 2, 1)$ onto the plane $x + y + z = 0$ in \mathbb{R}^3 via the projection matrix.

Solution

We seek a set of basis vectors for the plane $x + y + z = 0$. We claim the two vectors $(1, 0, -1)$ and $(2, -1, -1)$ form a basis. (Any two vectors solving $x + y + z = 0$ that are not multiples of one another will work.) Set

$$\mathbf{A} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & -1 \\ 2 & -1 & -1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

Then

$$\mathbf{A} \mathbf{A}^T = \begin{pmatrix} 2 & 3 \\ 3 & 6 \end{pmatrix}$$

and

$$(\mathbf{A} \mathbf{A}^T)^{-1} = \begin{pmatrix} 2 & 3 \\ 3 & 6 \end{pmatrix}^{-1} = \begin{pmatrix} 2 & -1 \\ -1 & \frac{2}{3} \end{pmatrix}.$$

Hence,

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{P} &= \mathbf{A}^T (\mathbf{A} \mathbf{A}^T)^{-1} \mathbf{A} \\ &= \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & -1 \\ 2 & -1 & -1 \end{pmatrix}^T \begin{pmatrix} 2 & -1 \\ -1 & \frac{2}{3} \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & -1 \\ 2 & -1 & -1 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= \frac{1}{3} \begin{pmatrix} 2 & -1 & -1 \\ -1 & 2 & -1 \\ -1 & -1 & 2 \end{pmatrix} \end{aligned}$$

So,

$$\mathbf{P} \mathbf{b} = \text{proj}_{\mathcal{W}} \mathbf{b} = \frac{1}{3} \begin{pmatrix} 2 & -1 & -1 \\ -1 & 2 & -1 \\ -1 & -1 & 2 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} = -\frac{1}{3} \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ -2 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

We note that

$$\mathbf{P} (\mathbf{P} \mathbf{b}) = \mathbf{P} (\text{proj}_{\mathcal{W}} \mathbf{b}) = \frac{1}{3} \begin{pmatrix} 2 & -1 & -1 \\ -1 & 2 & -1 \\ -1 & -1 & 2 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} -1/3 \\ 2/3 \\ -1/3 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} -1/3 \\ 2/3 \\ -1/3 \end{pmatrix}$$

and, hence, $\mathbf{P}^2 = \mathbf{P}$.

Why is this not surprising?

Properties of a Projection Matrix:

(1) $\mathbf{P}^2 = \mathbf{P}$ (That is, \mathbf{P} is *idempotent*.)

(2) $\mathbf{P}^T = \mathbf{P}$ (That is, \mathbf{P} is *symmetric*.)